



P.O. Box 3726, Charleston, WV 25337
426 Leon Sullivan Way, Charleston, WV 25301
Telephone: 304-344-5760
TDD: 304-343-4136
www.wdbkc.org

Workforce Development Board of Kanawha County

Board Meeting April 18, 2023

Board Minutes

Present:

Commissioner Carper, CLEO
Aaron Alexander
Rachel Bowman
Paul Breedlove
John Haer
Carol Howerton
Todd Jones
Ellen Maxwell-Hoffman
Tim Morris
Jill Oliver
Greg Osbourne
Chanda Perry
Andy Richardson
Chris Settles
Travis Tarr
Dustin Vaughan
Shane Wilson

Absent:

Steve Collins
Sean Hill
Brett Matthews
Lee Roberts
Victoria Russo
Derrick Thomas

Staff:

Summer Johnston
Tamara Lee
Julie Norman
Michele Painter
Makayla Pritt
Courtney Saunders
Nita Shafer
Ray Walker

Guests:

David Rogers
Jason Roberts
Jarl Taylor
Leslie Koepsel
Hannah Pullin
Angie Johnson
Cris Sommerville
Brandon Morris
Michael Crown
Maureen Persons

Opening-Board Secretary, Aaron Alexander, called the meeting to order at 9:15 am. Aaron asked Courtney Saunders to do roll call. Aaron reported that Herman & Cormany staff was present to give a preliminary draft audit report for program year 2021 so the agenda order will be changed.

New Business

Preliminary Draft Audit Report 2021 Herman & Cormany- Commissioner Carper asked how many types of audits were required. Julie responded that WDBKC is supposed to have an internal audit and an audit done by WFWV. Commissioner Carper asked if the annual audit had been completed yet and Julie said no. Julie said that WDBKC has no control over when the annual audit is completed and Commissioner Carper replied that wasn't true and asked Julie if she had sent an email to WFWV telling them that completing an audit would be a waste of money because the records are in horrendous shape, and Julie said that she had never made that request. Julie said that when she first got here, the audit was already a year late and that she might have felt that way then. Commissioner Carper said that he was trying to make a point, and that was why nothing could be finished. Commissioner Carper asked Cris Sommerville approximately how many days late the audit that he is currently working on is. Cris replied that the original due date was March 31, 2022, with a six-month extension because of COVID. Cris said that the audit is currently over six months late. Aaron asked if this audit was the one required by the federal clearinghouse and Cris responded that is correct. Andy Richardson asked if that meant on March 31, 2023, if WDBKC should have had the 2022 audit done and Cris responded that is correct.

Cris said that there are two separate audits and to clarify that this is not an internal audit, it is an external audit. Herman & Cormany is independent from the organization. There are three reports in this preliminary financial statement. The first one will be the independent auditors' report on the financial statements themselves, and in accordance with GAP, Herman & Cormany was able to produce an unmodified opinion. Commissioner Carper asked what unmodified opinion meant and Cris responded that an unmodified opinion meant that everything that was presented was free from material misstatement. Commissioner Carper asked who Cris worked with primarily for the information and he responded Michele and Nita. Cris said that towards the back of the statement are two reports, one on internal controls and one on compliance. Herman and Cormany have issued an adverse opinion in this area. Commissioner Carper asked what adverse opinion meant and Cris responded that it meant they could not form an opinion. Commissioner Carper asked how long Herman & Cormany had been working on the current audit and Cris responded since November 2022. Cris said that when a problem arose, he and other staff would work with Michele and Nita to solve it instead of making it an audit finding. Commissioner Carper clarified that Herman & Cormany were telling WDBKC there were problems with their financials and Cris said yes. Commissioner Carper asked what that meant, and Cris said that it means that the individual at the time was keeping records that was not put into QuickBooks and did not carryover. Commissioner Carper asked if that would put WDBKC in a risk situation and Cris responded that it would come down to the funders, and how the records are maintained going forward. WDBKC is high-risk and Herman & Cormany will be required to pull more records. Commissioner Carper asked when Cris was hired to perform the audit and Michele responded that the engagement letter was signed by Andy Sweetnich and JD Cook, both previous finance managers, and then Michele signed an engagement letter in July and began uploading documents for review. Julie said that the original engagement letter was signed in April 2022.

Commissioner Carper asked if this situation was ever reported to the Executive Board, that the records are so bad that the audit cannot be done and is late so now the second audit is late. Commissioner Carper asked Aaron if the full board was ever notified, and Aaron responded that the board was told that the audit was behind and there was a question of if a clean audit was possible because of clean records or not. Chris asked if the engagement letter was done in April of 2022, shouldn't WDBKC already of been engaging with the outside audit firm before April? Cris said that work cannot begin until the previous year is finished. Commissioner Carper asked if Cris had ever met with Julie over the audit and he said no. Commissioner Carper asked if Cris had ever received a request or email from Julie expressing the urgency and importance of having the audit done and how terrible it is for the audit to be late, and Cris responded that she had stopped in inquiring about the status of the audit.

Commissioner Carper asked when that was, and Cris responded November.

Commissioner Carper asked if that was when the heated argument took place and Michele said no the heated argument was recently, back in March. Commissioner Carper asked if it was the issue about BRIM and Michele responded it was. Commissioner Carper asked what happened that day. Michele said that Julie came there and she was asking her and Nita about the BRIM coverage and they were on the phone with BRIM, Nita explained what BRIM had said and Julie said that we can't just go with what they said and Michele interjected and said this is what they said and he said he's going to reach out to us and send us an email and Julie told Michele to shut her mouth and listen for a minute. Commissioner Carper said then said that those who recall during the last meeting asked if there was a staff issue, and

he was told no. Julie then said that she did not tell her to shut her mouth, but she did tell her to listen. Julie said that she relies on information in writing. Commissioner Carper said that Michele oversees all financial matters, and she's not telling the truth? Julie said "she was relying on something said over the phone that turned out to be inaccurate, but I did not tell her to shut her mouth." Commissioner Carper said Michele is lying to the board and Julie said that is not what she is saying but she also did not tell Michele to shut her mouth. Chris Settles asked Nita if she was present during this and what was said, Nita said yes, and that Julie said shut her mouth. Chris asked Courtney Saunders if she was present and she responded no, she wasn't present during this particular incident. Chris then asked Tamara and said she wasn't present.

Ellen asked if this audit was ready to be submitted and Cris responded that there are a few things he still needs to do, but after that it will be ready to submit.

Commissioner Carper asked what happened with the claim with BRIM and Julie responded that the internal investigator that BRIM hired has submitted documents to BRIM and BRIM will issue a final determination. Commissioner Carper said that under federal law, he is responsible. Commissioner Carper asked when the last time Julie had inquired about the claim and Julie responded on Wednesday. Commissioner Carper asked if Julie had recently written up any of the employees for insubordination and Julie responded yes. Commissioner Carper asked who and if it was reported to the board. Julie responded Michele and no it was not reported to the board because she does not report staff issues to the board. Commissioner Carper asked what the sanction was for and Julie replied a public outburst and for saying write me up, I don't have time to listen to this and stormed off. Julie said that it all revolved around the way she handled the situation. The question asked was what had been done about BRIM and that is how the argument started. Commissioner Carper said that there are two employees who are responsible for the finances and bookkeeping who are saying this happened and Julie says it is not true. Julie said that regardless of if I told her to shut her mouth or not, that is not important, what is important is the BRIM claim and what has been done. Julie said that she did not tell Michele to shut her mouth. Commissioner Carper asked if Julie thinks she handled this situation correctly and Julie responded that her tone was not any higher than it is now.

Commissioner Carper asked who approves the audit and Julie said the full board. Commissioner Carper said that the formal audit needs to be submitted for approval so the next audit can begin.

Commissioner Carper asked Julie if the mess of the records had been cleaned up or not and Julie said that the records had been cleaned up and the documents were submitted to the auditors over a year ago. Julie said that it was the auditors' fault for the lack of a complete audit and because of the engagement letter she was unaware she could fire the firm. Commissioner Carper asked who signed the engagement letter and Julie said that she had. Commissioner Carper asked what authority she had to do that. Julie said that she is responsible for the day-to-day operations. Commissioner Carper said you also signed the agreement with Martin Riggs on Capitol Street. Commissioner Carper said that Julie has sent emails saying there is a serious problem with not adhering to the by-laws and Julie agreed. Aaron asked Cris if the numbers in the initial report could tie into an accounting statement and Cris agreed. Rachel said that the enhanced desk monitoring that WorkForce West Virginia included a finding that was because of the single audit not being completed. Rachel said that the audit was not submitted to the Federal Audit Clearinghouse by the due date.

Aaron asked Cris what the adverse opinion meant, and Cris said that it is for compliance issues. Aaron asked him to explain the compliance issues found and Commissioner Carper said that adverse opinions are the second worst opinion to have in an audit. Commissioner Carper then asked Cris what the worst finding in an audit is and Cris responded that a firm would withdraw from the audit.

Cris said that the compliance issues are when WDBKC used spreadsheets to track allocations and funds. When Andy left, the spreadsheets were not used, and the financial manager and the outside CPA started using QuickBooks. Andy Richardson asked what the penalty is going to be for submitting material weaknesses. Julie responded that she would ask WorkForce WV. Commissioner Carper said that being late on any audit is a serious matter and that the state could cut the funding.

Aaron asked Cris if the findings would be addressed and rectified since QuickBooks have been being used and he said yes.

Rachel asked if the Audit policy was finalized that WDBKC had been modifying, and Julie responded that at the previous meeting there was a motion made to add headings and that has happened, but then two special meetings later there was a new motion that a lawyer would be looking at and modifying all policies.

Angie Johnson said that since WFWV is the pass-through entity and WDBKC is the subrecipient, WFWV would need to do a risk assessment. There will be a corrective action plan and some of the questions will be have the records been on QuickBooks since the year end. Aaron asked Angie if she would let Michele know about any risk assessment. Angie responded that anything will be a written notice, but she suggests in the policies having deadlines. Andy Richardson asked Michele if the chart of accounts as corrected addresses the material weaknesses and Michele responded yes. Aaron asked Cris that when the final audit report was done it would be sent so the board could review and approve it.

Commissioner Carper said that if the by-laws were followed the executive committee could vote on it and then bring it to the board for ratification.

Motion: Aaron said that currently there is not an executive committee because there is too many vacancies. Aaron asked for motion to make Ellen Maxwell-Hoffman interim vice-chair. Chris made the motion. Tim seconded the motion. All were in favor. Motion carried.

Nomination of Officers: Aaron reported that Brett assigned Aaron, Chris and Tim for the nominating committee for officer elections June. Ellen asked if the committee could nominate someone that is serving on the nominating committee and Chris said there is nothing in the by-laws that would prohibit that.

PY22 RFP for Auditors: Commissioner Carper asked what is going to be done about the Request for Proposal (RFP) for an independent auditor. Julie said that it has to be published, have a bidders' conference, have a review committee, and make recommendations to the board. Chris asked how long it was going to take to do the RFP and Michele said a month. Chris said that when it is released it needs to go out for 2022 and 2023 because WDBKC is already late. Michele said that the language in the RFP says that the award will be for 2022 with a renewal option for 2023. Herman & Cormany has been conducting the independent audit for WDBKC since 2009. Julie said that there are tentative dates staff has put together. Andy said that in the current RFP, the language says the audit field work must be completed no later than December 31 and received no later than no later than February 28th, this will

need corrected for this current audit. Julie said that dates will need to be in the language because if not, WDBKC will continue to run the risk of being late.

Motion: Andy made a motion to release the RFP by Friday April 21st, a proposal deadline of May 22nd, board review and approval the following week at a special called meeting. The firm will be hired by June 1st, August 15th to have the fieldwork completed and a report completed by September 30th so the firm can then start next year's audit immediately. Chris seconded the motion. All were in favor. Motion carried.

Approval of Minutes from February 21, 2023; March 2, 2023; March 10, 2023: Aaron reported that there are minutes from February 21, 2023. Aaron asked for a motion to approve the minutes. Tim and Ellen abstained from the vote. Aaron moved to adopt the minutes as written. Chris seconded the motion. All were in favor. Motion carried.

Aaron reported that there are minutes from a special meeting on March 2, 2023. Chris made a motion for Courtney to add breaks in the body without changing the substance of the meeting, add Chanda to present and add Commissioner Carper as the CLEO and not under guests. Ellen seconded the motion. All were in favor. Motion carried.

Aaron reported that there are minutes from March 10, 2023. Chris made a motion to move Commissioner Carper to the CLEO and not under guests and to approve the minutes. Tim seconded the motion. All were in favor. Motion carried.

Old Business

Discussion regarding an update concerning WFWV's "Demand for Reimbursement of Sub-Grant Funds": Aaron asked Julie if there was an update approving or denying this and Julie said that was correct. Commissioner Carper asked Julie when she had contacted BRIM last, and she responded two weeks ago. Julie said that she knew that BRIM had assigned this to an investigator in Wheeling named Terry Irving. Commissioner Carper asked Julie when the last time she had talked to him was, and Julie responded Wednesday. Julie reported that they are still conducting their investigation and will notify Julie as soon as BRIM has a response. Commissioner Carper said that the deadline was quickly approaching and asked what Julie's plan was. Aaron asked Julie to reach out to the claim adjuster and remind them of the importance and the deadline. Commissioner Carper said that when Julie says the board mis-spent money it was over what issue, and Julie replied that it was not mis-spent money, it was a lack of internal controls and methodology. Commissioner Carper asked Rachel if he was correct, and Rachel said that it was misuse of funds. Chris said that according to the enhanced desktop monitoring, in addition to the internal controls, there is the reasonableness of one of the amounts. Julie said that the board voted on that, and Commissioner Carper asked if the full board voted on the salary increase and the bonus. Julie said that the board voted on them in October and December. Commissioner Carper asked if the full board had to vote on any salary increase and Julie said yes. Commissioner Carper asked if the full board had to vote on any bonus and Julie said yes. Commissioner Carper said that he cannot find anything on any agenda, in any minutes or in any recordings that reflect any vote from the full board approving the salary increase or bonus. Chris asked Julie that per the bylaws according to ratification of any action taken by the executive committee, and Julie responded it must be ratified by

the full board. Chris said that anything done by the executive committee must be ratified at the next meeting of the full board. Chris said that Julies raise was in November and the bonus was in December, so no vote would have happened in October and there is nothing in the following meetings about Julies raise or bonus according to the recordings. Chris passed out some documents and asked Julie if she told the board what she wanted her salary to be and Julie said that after gathering the information they requested, the executive committee and herself came to an agreement based upon the documentation. Chris then said that in the documents passed out are handwritten notes from an executive meeting that does not have an agenda in November of 2021. There is also an agenda for the executive committee meeting in December of 2021 with two sets of minutes. The first set of minutes were submitted to the state during the enhanced desk monitoring and no where in there was any mention of Julies contract or bonus. In the second set of minutes there is mention of the bonus. Commissioner Carper asked Julie if salaries were confidential, and Julie said yes. Aaron asked Courtney to confirm that she had all executive committee minutes and Courtney replied that she did not start participating in the meetings until December of 2021. Commissioner Carper then asked Courtney if she was present during the December 2021 meeting and took notes of Julies bonus discussion and Courtney said that she was asked to step out because at the time she was not allowed to be a part of salary information. Chris said that in Courtneys minutes, the written minutes are accurate according to the recording until she was asked to step out. John Haer said that one document shows him as present, and one shows him as absent, and he was indeed present. Aaron said that this will be taken up as an internal control issue. Commissioner Carper moved that he would ask the state for another extension on this matter. Commissioner Carper then said the only person able to sign a legal document is the chairperson and Julie said that has not been the practice of the organization. Aaron said there will need to be a bylaw revision and violation of bylaws is not acceptable. Commissioner Carper asked Aaron if he was still in charge of compiling a list of names of lawyers for review by the board to hire.

Motion: Ellen made a motion to hire Mr. Brunstein and his legal group to revise all of Region III Workforce Development Boards policies to include the bylaws. Chris seconded the motion. All were in favor. Motion carried.

Aaron said that he was not sure where the money for that was going to come from. Chris asked if the state would assist with funds to hire Mr. Brunstein. Julie asked for clarification if that would also apply to the policies. Aaron answered yes, the policies, internal controls and bylaws.

Personnel Committee: Ellen said that during the last meeting there was discussion and a vote to form a personnel committee and she believes that converting that to a policy committee would be more beneficial.

Motion: Ellen made the motion to convert the personnel committee to a policy committee. Dustin seconded the motion. All were in favor. Motion carried.

Bank Card Signatures: reported that he was asked by Brett Matthews to go to Chase Bank to be put on the Bank Signature cards. Aaron said that this will allow him to sign checks.

Ratification Motion: Chris made the motion to approve Aaron Alexander, secretary of WDBKC Board, to be a signatory on the bank signature cards. Andy seconded the motion. All were in favor. Motion carried.

Commissioner Carper asked if there was a check register for the board to view. Michele said that is something that she can start providing in the board packets during the meeting.

Business Services Contract Renewal: Julie reported that WDBKC has a Business Services contract with Human Resources Development Foundation (HRDF) which expires in June with a renewal option of up to another three years. Julie said that HRDF also is contracted for the youth and one stop through WDBKC. The contract for the past year was \$75,000, which covered staff, and the contract will be for the same amount for the coming year.

Chris asked if HRDF had to follow the UGG according to their contract and Julie said no. Commissioner Carper asked Julie if she recommended that we extend the contract for a year and Julie said yes. Chris said that during the CLEO and Board training, it was announced that in any subrecipient contract can have the UGG language added and be made to follow that guidance. Julie said that WDBKC can modify the contract for Business Services and present it to the board for approval to start on July 1st.

Discussion of Transfer of Funds from Dislocated Worker to Adult: Commissioner Carper asked how much the transfer was for and Michele responded that the request was for \$600,000. Commissioner Carper said that this type of request continues to come year after year, and he does not understand why. Michele said that the amounts awarded by WorkForce West Virginia for the adult program are minimal, the last year was only \$61,000 compared to the \$884,000 for the dislocated worker program. Commissioner Carper asked if that is what WDBKC had asked for and Michele responded that WDBKC does not ask for it, WorkForce West Virginia tells each region what their allocation will be for each program year. Aaron asked for clarification that WDBKC has a few "buckets" of money, and there is one that has funds that can not be used because there is not participants that fall under that criteria to be served and one bucket that is now empty because WDBKC serves more participants that fall under that criteria. Michele said that is correct and WDBKC said that at any time 100% of those funds could be requested to be transferred to either bucket but WDBKC does not completely deplete the Dislocated Worker bucket because there could still be an individual that comes in to be served that would be categorized as a Dislocated Worker and not an adult. Julie said that every region has the same issue. Commissioner Carper asked Michele in what order does he sign the transfer and Michele responded he is the first one. Commissioner Carper asked if he had already signed it and the answer was yes. Commissioner Carper asked how long it took for him to sign it after there was an explanation and Michele said one day.

Motion- Ellen made the motion to approve the reallocation of funds as previously accepted by the CLEO Commissioner Carper. Tim seconded the motion. All were in favor. Motion carried.

Discussion of Subcontractors Travel: Aaron reported that during a previous meeting, there were limitations put on WDBKC staff for out of state travel, then the question arose if the subcontractors of WDBKC need the board's approval also. Commissioner Carper said that the board voted all out of state travel would be approved by the full board, so going forward, all subcontractors out of state travel also needs to be approved by the board. Aaron asked if the subrecipients provided a budget, and Julie responded yes. Julie said as a contractor their current contracts do not have the UGG language but

when that language is put into the contracts then we will have to see detailed budgets.

Motion- Aaron made a motion that any subcontractor needs board approval for out of state travel starting July 1st, 2023, or to reallocate line items already approved in their budget. Jill seconded the motion. All were in favor. Motion carried.

Discussion of PEIA Insurance Premiums; Policy & Increase: Commissioner Carper asked how much the premium increased and Julie responded 15.7% and Commissioner Carper asked what that was in a dollar amount. Michele responded that the monthly increase will be \$2,268.31 and Commissioner Carper said that is about \$25,000 a year, how are we going to pay for that. Julie responded that when the budgets are done before July 1st, this will be built into the fringes. Commissioner Carper said that the budget for WDBKC has been flat, but there is a standing merit pay policy every year. Commissioner Carper asked Julie if she had asked for more money and the answer was yes. Michele said that WDBKC currently pays 100% of the employee plan, and 70% of the family or child or spouse coverage. Julie said that there are several options WDBKC has proposed for the board to choose from, an 80/20 split, 70/30 split, 50/50 split or only cover the employee with no option for any additional members to be added. Commissioner Carper asked Julie how she decided to take the position not to inform the board when she disciplined a staff member but will allow the board to make the decision to cut benefits. Julie asked where it is written where the board is to be notified upon any discipline of staff.

Aaron asked if this was an action that needed to be taken today by the board to be effective July 1st, 2023. The action is whether or not there will be a change to the employees' benefit premiums. Commissioner Carper asked what the 80/20 split will cost the average employee and Michele responded that the average single employee will be about \$109 a month, about \$55 each pay period. Andy asked if the agency would continue to be 70% of the family and the answer was no, everything would be an 80/20 split.

Motion- Ellen made the motion for WDBKC to adopt an 80/20 split for insurance premiums for the employee with family and the employee with family. Andy seconded the motion. All were in favor. Motion carried.

Discussion of new WorkForce West Virginia Policies: Compensation, Allowable Costs, One Stop Operator & Common Identifier: Julie reported that these are state policies that three of four were voted and approved on at the last state board meeting and one was tabled until the next meeting. Ellen made an observation that every policy says that they will be dispersed to applicable partners and Ellen said she does not know who that refers to but to wanted to make the group aware, so the correct individuals received a copy.

Discussion of Green Power Motor Update: Julie reported that the first contact with the company was in September of 2021. Since then, there have been many calls between WDBKC, Green Power Motor staff and BridgeValley staff. Julie said she then requested funds from Scott Adkins for the project in January of 2022. The grant was originally two years which later was changed to a one-year grant with the funds cut in half. Commissioner Carper said that BridgeValley is still conducting the same activities to date without WDBKC's help. Commissioner Carper asked how many names were provided to the company and Julie responded 400. Commissioner Carper asked how many of that 400 had been hired

and Julie responded the last count was about 12. Commissioner Carper said you drew down about \$160,000 from this grant, correct?

Commissioner Carper asked why Green Power Motor funds were used for the lease buyout on Capitol Street. Julie responded that in the grant for green power motors, there were funds for a call center lease. The call center was going to house the representative that would have been needed originally to hire 900 people that the company originally wanted. Commissioner Carper asked who signed the lease buyout and Julie responded that she did. Commissioner Carper asked if Julie had approval from the board and Julie responded yes, Commissioner Carper asked which board and Julie's response was the entire board. Commissioner Carper asked when the board approved the lease buyout and if this matter was on the agenda and in the minutes with a vote of the full board. Commissioner Carper asked Julie if she was certain that the board approved the buyout and Julie said yes, the full board approved it, she could not point to where it was written but she would locate that. Aaron asked if the lease at 405 Capitol Street was associated with Green Power? Chris said that this was WDBKC's existing space, and it was more than just the call center for Green Power Motors. Commissioner Carper asked why the lease buyout was only allocated to the Green Power Grant. Julie said she didn't know why it was only allocated to that grant. Commissioner Carper said that this matter needs to be discussed and Aaron asked if this issue could be reviewed again later because he was unaware of the buyout. Aaron asked Michele if money was used from the grant and for what purpose. Michele responded that there had been money spent and it was used on the buyout. Michele said in the grant there was money budgeted for space in the amount of \$100,000 and the buyout was for \$41,720.80, no rent had been used from Green Power for the space at Leon Sullivan until January of 2023. Michele reported that was because there were three special allotments of \$20,000 paid on August 11, 2022: \$10,860.40 on August 31, 2022, and the final payment of \$10,860.00 October 3, 2022.

Aaron asked what activities were being conducted while WDBKC had the Green Power funds. Michele responded that at 405 Capitol Street the Green Power Motor staff shared one office. Michele said that WDBKC was out of space and there was no way to maintain both spaces. Chris said that the amount of the lease included everyone else's office, not just Green Power staff. Aaron asked when the buyout was signed, and Chris responded August 10th, 2022. Commissioner Carper asked if there was any way there would be trouble with the state on this and Michele said that the official closeout is due April 28, 2023.

Discussion of Proposed Salary Cap for Executive Director: Commissioner Carper said that he added this to the agenda because the deputy staff at the governor's office said that the state believes \$90,000 is reasonable for an Executive Director. Commissioner Carper said that the state has already proposed their own policy that will limit the salaries to \$90,000 effective July 1st. Julie said that there are currently four local directors that make more than \$90,000. Commissioner Carper said the board just voted to cut employees salaries and that was unanimous. Tim said he believes to be ahead of the state he thinks the motion should be to cap the salary of the executive director at \$90,000 and if the state does not pass their policy, then this can be revisited at a later date. Tim said to be able to put what the previous board did behind us and with the insurance premiums that went up and with the unanimous vote to cut employee salaries, he believes this is the best idea for the board.

Motion- Tim made the motion to cap the executive director's salary at \$90,000 effective July 1st, 2023. Andy seconded the motion. Todd opposed the motion. Commissioner Carper asked for a roll call vote.

Motion carried.

Members who voted yes: Aaron Alexander; Rachel Bowman; John Haer; Jill Oliver; Greg Osbourne; Chris Settles; Travis Tarr; Shane Wilson; Andy Richardson.

Members who were opposed: Todd Jones; Chanda Perry; Dustin Vaughan

Aaron asked if there was any discussion: Julie said that DOL has no issue with her salary, WFWV approved her salary, the CLEO approved her salary when he signed off on the budget. Julie said in 2007 she made 84,400 working for WFWV and upon doing the Bureau of Labor Statistics CPI inflation calculator, that 2007 salary is worth \$126,000 today without any kind of bonus or raise included. Julie said that the new members of the board do not know the qualifications or the amount of work she has put into the organization. Tim said that if what Commissioner Carper said is true and Julie went from \$84,000 to \$117,000 in a matter of months with handwritten notes. Tim said the actions here need to be transparent and there is nothing stopping the board from revisiting the executive director's salary at a later date. Julie said that a \$30,000 pay cut is a tremendous hardship for anyone. Todd said as a point of discussion and an area of concern is when Julie leaves and the board tries to hire a new director there is a cap on the salary at only \$90,000. Chris said that in other states some directors make less and here in this state current directors are already making less than that.

Other Discussion: Andy said that one of the policies is consistent with the fiscal year concerning annual evaluation tied to compensation that he believes needs to be a standing issue at the June/July meeting. Commissioner Carper said that it is concerning that staff is disciplined because of something he has said or done. Chris said that questions were asked today, and answers were provided from staff that should have no disciplinary action or retaliation taken against them and Julie said that there will not be.

Financial Report: Aaron reported that the financial report was provided in the packets and also emailed when the other documents were provided, and Michele was available if any member had a question or concern.

Motion: Aaron asked for a motion to approve the finance report as received. Andy made the motion. Dustin seconded the motion. All were in favor. Motion carried.

Program Report: Aaron asked Tamara if there was anything she needed to tell the members that was not in her report provided already and she said no, everything was covered.

Executive Director Report: Aaron asked Julie if everything was in her report and provided to the members. Julie said that there are a few additional items that need to be added or handed out. Julie said the traffic in the American Job Center continues to increase, January was 373, February was 442 and March was 647 to receive services. Julie reported that another item is the letter to the state board signed by the other directors and their CLEOS regarding policies. Julie said that she did not sign this letter. Julie reported the last item and the Memorandum of Understanding to form the West Virginia Workforce Development Board Association among the seven directors. Several states have an association among the directors to integrate and speak in unison on matters that affect the local boards. Commissioner Carper asked if it required any dues and Julie said no. Commissioner Carper asked how vacation worked here and Aaron said it depended on the

employee. Michele said that based on 1 to 5 years of service an employee will get 1.25 days per month, 5 to 10 years an employee will get 1.5 days per month, 10 to 15 years an employee will get 2 days per month and anything over 15 years an employee will get 3 days. Sick accrual is 1.25 days for every employee regardless of years of service. Commissioner Carper asked how employees keep track of their time and Michele said that there is a timekeeping clock. Commissioner Carper asked Julie if she also does that and Julie responded that Courtney does her timesheet.

Aaron has deferred two items on the agenda until the next meeting, Direct vs. Overhead and the discussion regarding any and all financial matters regarding Region III.

Motion-Aaron Alexander asked for a motion to adjourn the meeting. Andy made the motion. Tim seconded the motion. All were in favor. Meeting adjourned at 12:38 pm.

Respectfully Submitted by: Courtney Saunders
Office Coordinator WDBKC 05/18/2023